

Government of the District of Columbia Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B

RESOLUTION #4B-22-1102

Calling for Urgent School Building Repairs at Whittier Elementary School and Legislative Changes to Ensure Timely School Modernizations

Adopted November 28, 2022

Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B takes note of the following:

- Whittier Elementary School (6201 5th Street, NW) is a neighborhood Science, Technology, Engineering, and Math (STEM) school in Ward 4. The school serves students from PreK3 through Grade 5, exposing them to hands-on STEM activities and challenges throughout the academic school year and beyond, pioneering new self-exploration discoveries, and helping students be contributors to their community. Whittier Elementary School is a Title One school, with a significant population of historically disadvantaged students.
- Whittier Elementary School's facility was built in 1926. Expansions occurred in 1931 (eight rooms) and 1937 (auditorium). The school building is old and in severe disrepair. For years, the roof has leaked, causing a collapsed ceiling in 2018, pooling water on all floors, peeling and bubbling paint, squishy and stained walls, damaged classroom materials, displaced students from classrooms to common areas, and raising severe risk of mold. While the collapsed ceiling in 2018 resulted in Whittier Elementary School being placed on the stabilization projects list for a full roof replacement in the summer of 2019, that replacement was not completed until October 2020 and the renovated roof continues to leak, leading to emergency roof repair bidding just two years after completion.
- Whittier Elementary School is inaccessible to both teachers and students. Some teachers have faced challenges due to the lack of an elevator or chair lift in the building. Some students who require the use of wheelchairs have been turned away from the school due to inability to access the school due to the lack of an elevator or chair lift in the building and lack of a ramp to access the building. The lack of accessibility raises concerns under the Americans with Disabilities Act and contravenes DC Public Schools policy regarding non-discrimination. See DC Public Schools, "Notice of Non-Discrimination" (accessed Nov. 27, 2022) ("District of Columbia Public Schools (DCPS) does not discriminate

(including employment therein or admission thereto) on the basis of actual or perceived race, color, disability, religion, national origin, sex, age, marital status, personal appearance, sexual orientation, gender identity or expression, family status, family responsibilities, matriculation, political affiliation, genetic information, disability, source of income, status as a victim of an interfamily offense, or place of residence."). While an elevator is currently under construction, these challenges have existed since the school building opened, and other schools also do not meet accessibility requirements. Whittier Elementary School should be accessible to the whole community.

- Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B approved Resolution 4B-19-1002, Calling for Accelerated Modernization of Whittier Education Campus at the Commission's October 28, 2019, meeting (attached). At the time, Whittier Elementary School was ranked 11 on the Capital Improvement Plan¹ for schools to be modernized starting in Fiscal Year 2024. See Planning Actively for Comprehensive Education Facilities Amendment Act of 2016, DC Code § 38-2803(d)(3) (describing objective criteria for prioritizing major construction and capital improvements, including facility condition and equity). The Resolution noted the longstanding building issues related to health, safety, and accessibility, calling on the Mayor and the DC Council (1) to fund a full modernization of Whittier Education Campus, with a design phase proceeding in Fiscal Year 2020, and with full modernization and construction taking place in Fiscal Year 2021 and Fiscal Year 2022; and (2) to reconsider the school facility Capital Improvement Plan scoring criteria to address the limited impact of Phase 1 modernizations on the need for school modernizations, to adequately ensure compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, and to ensure robust consideration of equity.
- The Commission received a <u>response from DC Public Schools</u> to its Resolution (attached), which noted, in its entirety: "DC Public Schools (DCPS) is committed to continuing the full modernization program based on the Planning Actively for Comprehensive Education Facilities Amendment Act of 2016, <u>DC Code § 38-2803(d)(3)</u> (PACE) list and available swing space. DCPS is actively working through the PACE list to accommodate the next series of schools based on available capital funding and available swing space." School modernization rankings are difficult to find and not transparent, including some DC Public Schools' resources relying on <u>failed Google Drive links</u>.

¹ It is extremely difficult to even find the list of schools scheduled for modernization. Commissioners have found this information in <u>past DC Council oversight documents</u>, but the priority list for school modernizations should be readily available on the DC Public Schools' "<u>School Modernizations</u>" webpages, which are incomplete and outdated in many aspects, including <u>missing documents for all active School Improvement Teams across the District</u>, requiring Google Drive access for facility condition assessments, an empty <u>School Improvement Team and community meetings calendar</u>, and a nonexistent <u>sustainability page</u>.

- Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B approved Resolution 4B-22-0202, Calling on DCPS to Allocate FY 2023 Funding to Build Swing Space in Ward 4 at the Commission's February 28, 2022, meeting. The Resolution called for adequate funding to construct or lease a new Ward 4 satellite swing space location to be utilized by Truesdell, Whittier, and LaSalle-Backus Elementary Schools over the next decade. The Commission received a response to this letter (although it was not posted on the Advisory Neighborhood Commission Resolution Portal), and swing space was funded in the District's Fiscal Year 2023 budget, preventing further delay of the modernization projects at these schools and ensuring in-ward swing space (in spite of efforts by some Councilmembers to delay modernization of these schools).
- Whittier Elementary School continues to face severe accessibility, health, and safety issues with regard to their school building, including:
 - <u>non-compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act</u>, including an elevator that is still under construction and lack of an outdoor ramp to access the building;
 - <u>leaking roof</u>, including in the school's kitchen, and growing wall and ceiling cracks and water running down the stairway when it rains (*see*, *e.g.*, Work Order #682392; Work Order #716924; Work Order #716925);
 - malfunctioning temperature control (HVAC) equipment, including instances where children and teachers had to wear coats all day because of lack of heat;
 - <u>a burst radiator</u>, resulting in removal of the radiator and lack of heat in the building;
 - <u>falling bricks from the building façade</u>, including around the early childhood education entrance and the playground area (*see*, *e.g.*, Work Order #658840)
 - <u>sewage backup and plumbing issues</u>, impacting early childhood education spaces with the smell of sewage in class and water backup in the bathroom drain (*see, e.g.*, Work Order #724642);
 - broken water fountains (see, e.g., Work Order #715195);
 - non-working bathrooms on and entire floor of the building (see, e.g., Work Order #725178);
 - PreK doors that will not lock (see, e.g., Work Order #722263);
 - broken lights in the gymnasium (see, e.g., Work Order #725145); and

- uninstalled Smart Boards.
- Advisory Neighborhood 4B Commissioners have received email communications from the Whittier Elementary School community over October and November 2022, calling for immediate modernization of the school to remedy accessibility, health, and safety concerns. The school's Parent Teacher Organization hosted a "Rally for Your Rights" on November 4, 2022, to highlight building code violations, the school's leaking roof, HVAC issues, plumbing issues, and falling bricks from the building façade, and a "Call to Action Rally" on November 17, 2022, to call for urgent modernization. Commissioner Jocelynn Johnson (4B03) and Commissioner Palmer (4B02) have attended protests and testified before the DC Council and DC Public Schools, including as recently as this month, as well as advocated to the DC Council, regarding the need for repairs (including mold and lead testing and remediation) and modernization.
- Chancellor Lewis D. Ferebee responded to the Whittier Elementary School community in a November 8, 2022, letter (attached), noting Whittier's modernization occurs according to the Planning Actively for Comprehensive Education Facilities Amendment Act and will occur in school years 2025 to 2027, despite calls for more urgent action. The Letter also stated, "DCPS and the Department of General Services (DGS) continue to perform preventive maintenance at Whittier, respond to maintenance requests as they are received, and complete small capital projects. The roof repair over the multipurpose room and lead paint abatement were completed earlier this calendar year, and the elevator project is slated to be completed by the end of calendar year 2022." As noted above, the District Department of General Services has failed to provide timely repairs. And modernization by 2027 fails to take into account these longstanding accessibility, health, and safety issues that warrant urgent attention.
- While the DC Council has acted on Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B's Resolution 4B-21-0904, Calling for District Department of General Services to Provide Online Dashboard to Track Status of DC School Facilities, approved at the Commission's September 27, 2021, meeting, to improve transparency of reporting with regard to the Department's processing of work orders, the problems persist and it is clear existing legislation is insufficient to ensure accessible, healthy, and safe school buildings. See District Department of General Services Work Order Dashboard; see also B24-1054, Work Order Integrity Amendment Act of 2022 (requiring school-level staff member approval before marking a repair request as complete) (under DC Council review); B24-0920, Backto-School Safely Emergency Amendment Act of 2022 (emergency legislation requiring DC Public Schools to report on the readiness of their facilities for in-person learning) (expired).

The Whittier Elementary School community has advocated for years for modernization of its school building and timely completion of school repairs. The District government has responded with piecemeal and incomplete repairs, failing to address the lack of accessibility and risking the health and safety of the school's children and teachers. Timely modernization would have and still could save money on these inadequate and piecemeal repairs. See Resolution 4B-19-1002, Calling for Accelerated Modernization of Whittier Education Campus (Oct. 28, 2019) ("While it may be possible to engage in temporary fixes, Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B believes full modernization is necessary for the health and safety of students and faculty, to ensure a fully accessible and Americans with Disabilities Act-compliant facility, and in the District's financial interest. Given the breadth of problems with the Whittier Education Campus facility, the District will save money by modernizing the building promptly rather than engaging in temporary fixes that may not fully address the problems and where the facility will ultimately be modernized.").

RESOLVED:

- ➤ That Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B calls on the District Department of General Services to timely complete school building work orders at Whittier Elementary School and report on the status and completion of these work orders to the Commission and the DC Council.
- ➤ That Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B calls on DC Council to exercise additional oversight of the District Department of General Services to ensure timely completion of school building work orders, including at Whittier Elementary School, and to ensure the quality of the final work product for small repairs and larger capital projects to prevent emergency repairs being immediately necessary like at Whittier Elementary School.
- ➤ That Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B calls on DC Council to exercise additional oversight of the District Department of General Services to ensure a process for mold testing and remediation at Whittier Elementary School in light of the years and years of roof leaks that substantially increase the risk of mold in the building.
- ➤ That Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B calls on the DC Council's Committee of the Whole, the Deputy Mayor for Education, and DC Public Schools leadership to reconsider the school facility Capital Improvement Plan scoring criteria to adequately ensure compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act and to ensure robust consideration of equity. Action needs to be taken to correct for disparities in school modernizations: only the schools in Ward 3 are fully modernized, leading to concerns about the equity element of the Capital Improvement Plan process.

- ➤ That Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B calls on the Mayor and the DC Council to adequately fund school modernizations based on need and for timely modernization of schools based on revised criteria that includes compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act and robust consideration of equity.
- ➤ That Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B calls on DC Public Schools to immediately update its "School Modernizations" webpages to include an easily accessible and understandable schedule for school modernizations and to update all incomplete existing webpages. Having a complete list of modernized schools and the schools scheduled for modernization will ensure transparency and accountability as to equity in school modernizations.

FURTHER RESOLVED:

That the Commission designates Commissioner Jocelynn Johnson, 4B03, and Commissioner Erin Palmer, ANC 4B02, to represent the Commission in all matters relating to this Resolution.

FURTHER RESOLVED:

That, in the event the designated representative Commissioners cannot carry out their representative duties for any reason, the Commission authorizes the Chair to designate another Commissioner to represent the Commission in all matter relating to this Resolution.

FURTHER RESOLVED:

That, consistent with DC Code § 1-309, only actions of the full Commission voting in a properly noticed public meeting have standing and carry great weight. The actions, positions, and opinions of individual commissioners, insofar as they may be contradictory to or otherwise inconsistent with the expressed position of the full Commission in a properly adopted resolution or letter, have no standing and cannot be considered as in any way associated with the Commission.

ADOPTED by voice vote at a regular public meeting (notice of which was properly given, and at which a quorum of six members was present) on November 28, 2022, by a vote of 6 yes, 0 no, 0 abstentions.



Government of the District of Columbia Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B

RESOLUTION #4B-19-1002

Calling for Accelerated Modernization of Whittier Education Campus
Adopted October 28, 2019

Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B takes note of the following:

- Whittier Education Campus (6201 5th Street, NW) is a neighborhood school in Ward 4 whose mission is to provide an interactive, hands-on approach to inquiry and project-based learning focused on science, technology, engineering, and mathematics. The school currently serves nearly 400 students in grades PK3–5, 7, and 8, and boasts a student satisfaction rate of 99 percent. See My School DC, "Whittier Education Campus," available at https://www.whittierdc.org/. The school staff is remarkably stable, with many teachers who have been with the school for 20–30 years, and some of whom even attended the school as children.
- Whittier Education Campus's facility was built in 1926. Expansions occurred in 1931 (eight rooms) and 1937 (auditorium). The school is one of 32 school facilities that have received only a "Phase I" modernization in previous fiscal years. Phase 1 modernizations are smaller, targeted renovations meant to be paired with additional phases (that were never completed) to bring the school up to standards. For Whittier Education Campus, the Phase 1 modernization primarily included building the cafeteria. A large portion of the Whittier Education Campus facility was not touched by this Phase 1 modernization, and the needs are far greater than the work completed.
- Whittier Education Campus is ranked 11 on the Capital Improvement Plan for schools to be modernized starting in Fiscal Year 2024. See Planning Actively for Comprehensive Education Facilities Amendment Act of 2016, DC Code § 38-2803(d)(3) (describing objective criteria for prioritizing major construction and capital improvements, including facility condition and equity); see also id. at § 38-2803(d)(3)(D) (noting consideration of "immediate life and safety concerns" when determining prioritization and inclusion of projects in school facility Capital Improvement Plan).

- DC Public Schools has stated, "it is our intention that all schools receiving a modernization will receive a full modernization, which assesses the building and site holistically. This approach marks a departure from past projects, which were approached in a phased fashion that assessed only a specific portion or system of the building." School Modernization Manual at 3, available at https://drive.google.com/file/d/14pn7yIznTg0Ur7wrLz27B1jq5qd12N4I/ view.
- The Whittier Education Campus facility is in severe disrepair. For years, the roof has leaked, causing a collapsed ceiling in 2018, pooling water on all floors, peeling and bubbling paint, squishy and stained walls, damaged classroom materials, and displaced students from classrooms to common areas. It is almost certain that the persistent water damage has resulted in mold within the walls, which requires timely and full remediation. See generally World Health Organization, WHO Guidelines for Indoor Air Quality: Dampness and Mould at 72 (2009), available at http://www.euro.who.int/__data/assets/pdf_file/0017/43325/E92645. pdf (noting "well-designed study ... within a body of generally consistent findings that dampness-related exposure is not only associated with, but may cause, asthma in infants and children"). While the collapsed ceiling in 2018 resulted in Whittier Education Campus being placed on the stabilization projects list for a full roof replacement in the summer of 2019, that replacement never occurred. See https://drive.google.com/file/d/1YRqAlzO316x5X7OxhCkGMCS0I-T93o2B/view. The school was recently told roof replacement might be possible by the winter.
- Whittier Education Campus is inaccessible to both teachers and students. Some teachers have faced challenges due to the lack of an elevator or chair lift in the building, one of whom will likely be forced to leave their position with the school, disrupting the consistency and quality of education for the school's students. And some students who require the use of wheelchairs have been turned away from the school due to inability to access the school. The lack of accessibility raises concerns under the Americans with Disabilities Act and contravenes DC Public Schools policy regarding non-discrimination. See DC Public Schools, "Notice of Non-Discrimination," available at https://dcps.dc.gov/non-discrimination ("District of Columbia Public Schools (DCPS) does not discriminate (including employment therein or admission thereto) on the basis of actual or perceived race, color, disability, religion, national origin, sex, age, marital status, personal appearance, sexual orientation, gender identity or expression, family status, family responsibilities, matriculation, political affiliation, genetic information, disability, source of income, status as a victim of an interfamily offense, or place of residence."). Whittier Education Campus should be accessible to the whole community.

- The Whittier Education Campus facility raises a number of other concerns, including the possibility of lead paint due to an aging building; peeling floors in various parts of the building (in part due to roof leaks), which requires taping down floor tiles to prevent tripping in classrooms; persistent problems with the facility's HVAC system; and an underutilized, large patch of asphalt for designated play space for younger kids.
- Whittier Education Campus is a Title One school, with a significant population of historically disadvantaged students. While DC Public Schools has renovated 100 percent of schools in Ward 3, only 67 percent of schools in Ward 4 have received full modernizations leading to concerns about the equity element of the Capital Improvement Plan process. See Valerie Jablow, "Game Of Insiders: Ferebee-Hope" (Oct. 1, 2019), available at https://educationdc.net/2019/10/01/game-of-insiders-ferebee-hope/ (citing recent analysis by Mary Levy regarding school modernizations).
- Advisory Neighborhood Commissioners from Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B have toured the school multiple times and noted the deteriorating conditions over the years. The Commissioners have expressed their concern to our government agency representatives and directors, our Ward 4 Councilmember, and other elected officials. Many of these individuals have expressed support for mechanisms to address the aforementioned issues and ensure the school is safe and accessible.
- While it may be possible to engage in temporary fixes, Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B believes full modernization is necessary for the health and safety of students and faculty, to ensure a fully accessible and Americans with Disabilities Act-compliant facility, and in the District's financial interest. Given the breadth of problems with the Whittier Education Campus facility, the District will save money by modernizing the building promptly rather than engaging in temporary fixes that may not fully address the problems and where the facility will ultimately be modernized. The District could explore the possibility of using Calvin Coolidge Senior High School and Ida B. Wells Middle School space as interim swing space during modernization to minimize relocation burden and cost.

RESOLVED:

➤ That Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B calls on the DC Council's Committee on Education, the Deputy Mayor for Education, and DC Public Schools leadership to fund a full modernization of Whittier Education Campus, with a design phase proceeding in Fiscal Year 2020,

- with full modernization and construction taking place in Fiscal Year 2021 and Fiscal Year 2022.
- ➤ That Advisory Neighborhood Commission 4B calls on the DC Council's Committee on Education, the Deputy Mayor for Education, and DC Public Schools leadership to reconsider the school facility Capital Improvement Plan scoring criteria to address the limited impact of Phase 1 modernizations on the need for school modernizations, to adequately ensure compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, and to ensure robust consideration of equity.

FURTHER RESOLVED:

That the Commission designates Commissioner Erin Palmer, ANC 4B02, and Commissioner Scot Knickerbocker, ANC 4B03, to represent the Commission in all matters relating to this Resolution.

FURTHER RESOLVED:

That, in the event the designated representative Commissioner cannot carry out their representative duties for any reason, the Commission authorizes the Chair to designate another Commissioner to represent the Commission in all matter relating to this Resolution.

FURTHER RESOLVED:

That, consistent with DC Code § 1-309, only actions of the full Commission voting in a properly noticed public meeting have standing and carry great weight. The actions, positions, and opinions of individual commissioners, insofar as they may be contradictory to or otherwise inconsistent with the expressed position of the full Commission in a properly adopted resolution or letter, have no standing and cannot be considered as in any way associated with the Commission.

ADOPTED by voice vote at a regular public meeting (notice of which was properly given, and at which a quorum of nine of nine members was present) on October 28, 2019, by a vote of 9 yes, 0 no, 0 abstentions.



Friday, December 6, 2019

Chairperson Parks, Commissioner Palmer and Commissioner Knickerbocker,

I am writing to acknowledge the receipt of ANC Resolution #4B-19-1002.

DC Public Schools (DCPS) is committed to continuing the full modernization program based on the Planning Actively for Comprehensive Education Facilities Amendment Act of 2016, DC Code § 38-2803(d)(3) (PACE) list and available swing space. DCPS is actively working through the PACE list to accommodate the next series of schools based on available capital funding and available swing space.

Thank you very much for your continued support of Whittier Education Campus. Please do not hesitate to contact myself or colleagues Quintin Floyd (quintin.floyd2@k12.dc.gov) and Eli Hoffman (elias.hoffman@k12.dc.gov) who work closely with this school in case you have any other concerns or questions.

Sarah Latterner Parker

Deputy Chief, Community Engagement

District of Columbia Public Schools

1200 First Street, NE

Washington, DC 20002



November 8, 2022

Dear Whittier Families and Community,

Thank you for reaching out and expressing your concerns about the Whittier Elementary School building.

The Whittier modernization project is scheduled to begin in the 2024-2025 School Year. The first year is a design year, followed by construction in school years 2025 to 2027. Whittier's modernization project was determined based on standard procedures as required by the Planning Actively for Comprehensive Education Facilities Amendment (PACE) Act for DC Public Schools, and as a result, we are not able to shift the modernization schedule.

The DCPS modernization schedule is determined by criteria outlined in the PACE Act. Specifically, every five years DCPS ranks schools for upcoming modernization projects. The ranking is performed utilizing objective data on facility condition, demand, community need, and equity. Each school site is assigned a score on a scale of 1-10 that is then weighted to determine the school's final prioritization score. DCPS then creates a six-year Capital Improvement Plan (CIP), to address the school district's modernization needs. This plan is ultimately reviewed and approved by the Mayor and Council.

DCPS and the Department of General Services (DGS) continue to perform preventive maintenance at Whittier, respond to maintenance requests as they are received, and complete small capital projects. The roof repair over the multipurpose room and lead paint abatement were completed earlier this calendar year, and the elevator project is slated to be completed by the end of calendar year 2022.

Thank you again for reaching out to express your concerns. We appreciate your engagement and truly value feedback from our stakeholders. We look forward to your continued engagement throughout the modernization process.

Sincerely,

Lewis D. Ferebee, Ed.D.

Chancellor, DC Public Schools

Lewis D. Finle